

Reviewer's report

Title: Reliability of measuring Abductor hallucis muscle parameters using two different diagnostic ultrasound machines

Version: 1 **Date:** 11 August 2009

Reviewer: Heidi Siddle

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The clinical relevance of measuring Abductor hallucis muscle parameters has not been defined in the introduction, why in particular have you chosen to measure this muscle and what are the benefits of measuring such parameters in clinical practice? Hence I have currently indicated that the 'Level of interest' of this article is only important to those with closely related research interests and not an article of importance in its field.

2. In the methods please explain which views were utilised, for example longitudinal or transverse, to ultrasound the muscle and why you have imaged in that particular plane.

3. You have stated that Reeves et al suggest that measurement error can be reduced by comparing US cross sectional results to MRI images in order to ensure accuracy, although MRI is a costly method to adopt in the clinical setting. This is can be fully appreciated however, please justify why you have not compared US against the gold standard MR or CT for imaging the Abductor hallucis muscle.

Minor Essential Revisions

4. Please make sure that the Figures are labelled as you have done with the Tables and not just in the Figure Caption List.

5. The ultrasound images should be labelled with which plane they were imaged in i.e. longitudinal or transverse.

6. Page 9 should read 'Reeves et al [15] suggest that' (not suggests), and a full stop is required at the end of this paragraph.

7. Page 11 the word 'of' is missing after the word 'type' in the first line of Conclusions, it should read 'type of US machine'

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being

published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.